

21. November 2023

Stellungnahme zum ZEW - Leibniz-Zentrum für Europäische Wirtschaftsforschung, Mannheim

Inhaltsverzeichnis

1.	Beurteilung und Empfehlungen	. 2
	Zur Stellungnahme des ZEW	
3.	Förderempfehlung	4

Anlage A: Darstellung

Anlage B: Bewertungsbericht

Anlage C: Stellungnahme der Einrichtung zum Bewertungsbericht

Vorbemerkung

Die Einrichtungen der Forschung und der wissenschaftlichen Infrastruktur, die sich in der Leibniz-Gemeinschaft zusammengeschlossen haben, werden von Bund und Ländern wegen ihrer überregionalen Bedeutung und eines gesamtstaatlichen wissenschaftspolitischen Interesses gemeinsam außerhalb einer Hochschule gefördert. Turnusmäßig, spätestens alle sieben Jahre, überprüfen Bund und Länder, ob die Voraussetzungen für die gemeinsame Förderung einer Leibniz-Einrichtung noch erfüllt sind.

Die wesentliche Grundlage für die Überprüfung in der Gemeinsamen Wissenschaftskonferenz ist regelmäßig eine unabhängige Evaluierung durch den Senat der Leibniz-Gemeinschaft. Die Stellungnahmen des Senats bereitet der Senatsausschuss Evaluierung vor. Für die Bewertung einer Einrichtung setzt der Ausschuss Bewertungsgruppen mit unabhängigen, fachlich einschlägigen Sachverständigen ein.

Vor diesem Hintergrund besuchte eine Bewertungsgruppe am 30. und 31. März 2023 das ZEW in Mannheim. Ihr stand eine vom ZEW erstellte Evaluierungsunterlage zur Verfügung. Die wesentlichen Aussagen dieser Unterlage sind in der Darstellung (Anlage A dieser Stellungnahme) zusammengefasst. Die Bewertungsgruppe erstellte im Anschluss an den Besuch den Bewertungsbericht (Anlage B). Das ZEW nahm dazu Stellung (Anlage C). Der Senat der Leibniz-Gemeinschaft verabschiedete am 21. November 2023 auf dieser Grundlage die vorliegende Stellungnahme. Der Senat dankt den Mitgliedern der Bewertungsgruppe und des Senatsausschusses Evaluierung für ihre Arbeit.

1. Beurteilung und Empfehlungen

Der Senat schließt sich den Beurteilungen und Empfehlungen der Bewertungsgruppe an.

Das ZEW – Leibniz-Zentrum für Europäische Wirtschaftsforschung untersucht die Bedingungen funktionstüchtiger Märkte und Institutionen, mit einem besonderen **Fokus** auf Innovation und Wettbewerbsfähigkeit in Europa. Dabei greift das Institut auf umfangreiche Expertise in der angewandten Mikroökonometrie und beeindruckende eigene Datenbestände zurück. Seine Forschungsergebnisse verbindet das ZEW sehr erfolgreich mit Aktivitäten in der Politikberatung.

Bereits bei der letzten Evaluierung war dem Institut eine ausgezeichnete **Entwicklung** bescheinigt worden. Diesen Weg setzt es mit ungebrochener Dynamik fort. Mit einem neuen Präsidenten, der sein Amt kurz danach antrat, entwickelte das ZEW ein neues Forschungsfeld zum Design von Märkten und Institutionen, das seit 2019 mit Mitteln eines großen strategischen Sondertatbestandes ausgebaut wird. Das Forschungsfeld wird in einzelnen Gruppen erarbeitet und in verschiedenen Themenfeldern fruchtbar gemacht. Damit hat das Institut sein Forschungsprofil sehr gut erweitert und eine gelungene Struktur für die weitere Implementierung des Marktdesign-Ansatzes entwickelt. Diese bietet das Potential, die Zusammenarbeit zwischen den Forschungseinheiten weiter zu stärken. Die dynamische Entwicklung findet auch auf der Ebene der derzeit sieben Forschungsbereiche und zwei Forschungsgruppen statt. Leitungswechsel wurden genutzt, um die jeweiligen Forschungsagenden neu auszurichten und innovative Fragen anzugehen.

Das ZEW erzielt hervorragende **Leistungen**. So fanden die Forschungsergebnisse durch zahlreiche Publikationen in hochrangigen Zeitschriften internationale Beachtung. Das Institut hat angemessene Instrumente zur Qualitätssicherung seiner Publikationen etabliert und publiziert seine referierten Artikel zur Hälfte im Open Access. Die vom Institut erhobenen Datensätze sind für die Messung von Industrieaktivitäten in Deutschland äußerst wertvoll (z. B. das *Mannheimer Unternehmenspanel* und das *Mannheimer Innovationspanel*). Im ZEW-Forschungsdatenzentrum werden sie auch für die externe wissenschaftliche Nutzung bereitgestellt. Wie vom Institut geplant, sollten die externen Zugriffsmöglichkeiten weiter verbessert werden. Es ist sehr gut, dass die Nutzung der Daten aus der Innovationserhebung nachgehalten wird. So sollte auch bei den anderen Erhebungen, die das ZEW verantwortet, vorgegangen werden. In der Politikberatung ist das Institut durch die Erstellung von Gutachten für Ministerien und Organisationen auf nationaler und internationaler Ebene sowie durch die Mitwirkung in Beratungsgremien sehr aktiv. Die Tätigkeiten von fünf Forschungsbereichen werden als "exzellent" bewertet, zwei Forschungsbereiche und eine Forschungsgruppe als "sehr gut bis exzellent".

Die **strategische Arbeitsplanung** schließt mit der Einrichtung eines "Research Hub" zur Durchführung von Feldexperimenten sehr gut an die Entwicklungen der letzten Jahre an. 2021 wurde zudem das neue, gesellschaftspolitisch wichtige Themenfeld "Gesundheitsmärkte und Gesundheitspolitik" in die Bearbeitung aufgenommen. Es wird derzeit in einer drittmittelfinanzierten Forschungsgruppe bearbeitet. Das ZEW sieht den Ausbau zu einem eigenständigen Forschungsbereich vor und möchte dafür zusätzliche Mittel in Höhe von 1 Mio. € ab dem Jahr 2027 (zzgl. 0,4 Mio. € Eigenanteil) über einen kleinen strategischen Sondertatbestand beantragen. Mit den Planungen nutzt das Institut Komplementaritäten mit anderen ZEW-Einheiten und Institutionen sehr gut. Das Vorhaben wird nachdrücklich befürwortet und sollte, wie im Bewertungsbericht ausgeführt, in einem Antrag weiter spezifiziert werden.

Die **Ausstattung** des ZEW mit Mitteln der institutionellen Förderung ist zur Erfüllung des derzeitigen Aufgabenspektrums auskömmlich. Mit 38 % des Gesamtbudgets wirbt das Institut einen hohen Anteil an Drittmitteln für Forschungsprojekte oder für Auftragsforschung ein, darunter umfangreiche Mittel von Bund und Ländern. Potenzial für weitere Einwerbungen besteht bei der EU.

Das ZEW wird durch den Präsidenten und den langjährigen kaufmännischen Direktor äußerst kompetent geleitet. Letzterer tritt 2024 in den Ruhestand ein. Das Verfahren für seine Nachfolge wurde frühzeitig eingeleitet und ist bereits abgeschlossen. Sehr positiv ist auch, dass mittlerweile für die Besetzung der **Leitungspositionen** in der Regel eine Verbindung mit W3-Professuren angestrebt wird. Der Senat begrüßt ausdrücklich die vom ZEW avisierte Option, auch stellvertretende Abteilungsleitungen in gemeinsamer Berufung mit einer Hochschule als Professur zu besetzen.

Die wissenschaftliche **Karriereentwicklung** wird am ZEW erfolgreich befördert. Das Institut verfügt über ein transparentes Entfristungsverfahren und bietet seinen zahlreichen Promovierenden hervorragende Bedingungen. Der Anteil von **Wissenschaftlerinnen** ist seit der letzten Evaluierung gestiegen. Auf Instituts- und Gruppenleitungsebene sind mittlerweile drei der zehn Leitungspositionen mit Frauen besetzt, auf Ebene der Stellvertretungen sind sogar ebenso viele Wissenschaftlerinnen wie Wissenschaftler tätig. Das ZEW sollte den eingeschlagenen Weg fortsetzen und auf allen Ebenen ein ausgeglichenes Geschlechterverhältnis erreichen.

Die engsten Verbindungen pflegt das ZEW mit den Universitäten Mannheim und Heidelberg, mit denen es über mehrere gemeinsame Berufungen verbunden ist. Mit der Universität Mannheim wird außerdem in einer Graduate School und einem Leibniz-WissenschaftsCampus zusammengearbeitet. Das internationale **Kooperationsnetzwerk** des Instituts umfasst eine große Gruppe renommierter Research Associates. Darüber hinaus sollte das ZEW Partnerschaften auch zu Institutionen strategisch ausbauen und verankern.

Der **Wissenschaftliche Beirat** begleitet das Institut sehr konstruktiv und engagiert. Bei neuen Besetzungen und bei der künftigen Arbeit sollten die spezifischen Hinweise im Bewertungsbericht und die allgemeinen Hinweise des Senats zur Organisation und zu den Aufgaben der Wissenschaftlichen Beiräte von Leibniz-Einrichtungen beachtet werden.

2. Zur Stellungnahme des ZEW

Der Senat begrüßt, dass das ZEW beabsichtigt, die Empfehlungen und Hinweise aus dem Bewertungsbericht bei seiner weiteren Arbeit zu berücksichtigen.

3. Förderempfehlung

Der Senat der Leibniz-Gemeinschaft empfiehlt Bund und Ländern, das ZEW als Einrichtung der Forschung und der wissenschaftlichen Infrastruktur auf der Grundlage der Ausführungsvereinbarung WGL weiter zu fördern.

Annex A: Status report

ZEW - Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research, Mannheim

Contents

1.	Key data, structure and tasks	A-2
2.	Overall concept and core results	A-3
3.	Changes and planning	A-6
4.	Controlling and quality management	A-8
5.	Human Resources	A-11
6.	Cooperation and environment	A-13
7.	Subdivisions of ZEW	A-15
8.	Handling of recommendations from the previous evaluation	A-20

Appendices:

A-23
A-24
A-25
A-26

1. Key data, structure and tasks

Key data

Year established:	1991
Admission to joint funding by Federal and <i>Länder</i> Governments:	1998
Admission to the Leibniz Association:	2004
Last statement by the Leibniz Senate:	2016
Legal form:	Limited liability company (GmbH)
Responsible department at Länder level:	Ministry of Science, Research and the Arts Baden-Württemberg, Stuttgart
Responsible department at Federal level:	Federal Ministry for Economic Affairs and Climate Action, Berlin

Total budget (2021)

€ 12.42m institutional funding

€ 4.62m revenue from project grants

€ 3.28m revenue from services

Number of staff (2021)

131 individuals in "research and scientific services"

15 individuals in "science supporting staff (in research units)"

58 individuals in "science supporting staff (administration, communication, management)"

Mission and structure

The leitmotif of the ZEW – Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research is the analysis and design of well-performing markets and institutions in Europe. To live up to it, ZEW follows the primary objectives of doing excellent and policy-relevant economic research and, on this basis, providing evidence-based policy advice to improve economic institutions and market outcomes, with a particular focus on Europe. Derived from this, ZEW's key aims are producing high-level publications with scientific and policy impact, promoting young researchers' careers both at the doctoral and postdoctoral level, and transferring knowledge from research to politics as well as to the national and European general public.

Structure

ZEW is structured into seven research units and two research groups. The service unit "General Services" supports the units. The service unit "Communications" is tasked with sharing ZEW's policy research with the public (see Appendix 1).

2. Overall concept and core results

ZEW investigates how the institutional framework and the rules of markets should be designed in order to enable the sustainable and efficient development of the European economy. The institute identifies **three topics** as connecting the specialised research and policy advisory activities in its nine research units:

- Aspects of the European integration are investigated with the aim to understand different reform options in order to enhance the resilience of the European Single Market. This includes research on harmonisation of European tax policies, labour market integration of refugees, or European competition and technology policies.
- The institute pursues research aimed at developing policy measures and leveraging the economic potential of **digitalisation**. Investigated topics include the potential of digitalisation to make the economy more resilient to crises and how employees are affected by changing job profiles due to automation.
- With its research on climate change and the energy transition, the institute aims to advance the understanding of how economic policy can support the transition to climate neutrality. The projects investigate, among others, the European Emissions Trading System, the implementation of sustainable finance directives, or aspects of international coordination in climate policy.

The institute highlights its methodological expertise in the field of applied microeconometrics and in the use of market design methods. It sees knowledge transfer as the common task of the entire scientific staff. Thereby, ZEW aims to guarantee feedback loops between policy advice and research and to ensure a high scientific quality and relevance of the studies and expert reviews produced for economic policy actors.

To combine policy-relevant research and evidence-based policy advice, ZEW has adopted a "centre strategy" for all its units. Each research unit is to develop its specific profile, with the aim to become visible as a centre of expertise, both in the academic and policy world. In line with the integrated ZEW approach, these centres are embedded in collaborations through joint academic and policy projects and the joint training of their doctoral researchers. In addition, the integrating role of the three overarching research topics and the common methodological basis, with a joint focus on modern microeconometrics and market design, contribute the common ZEW identity of all centres.

The institute involves researchers from other institutions as **ZEW Research Associates**. These are mostly university professors, who take on project management and supervisory functions at ZEW. They are involved in the further development of the research agenda, bring new sources of impetus to the institute's research work, and contribute to the qualification of young researchers. As of 31 December 2021, the institute had 113 Research Associates, thereof 38 worked at institutions in other European countries and 14 outside of Europe.

Results

In the period 2019-2021, ZEW **research results** were published in an annual average of 66.7 articles in peer reviewed journals, 16.3 articles in other journals, and 92.7 discussion papers (in house and external).

Examples of research results established at ZEW include the following:

- A study found that the monthly growth rate of the money supply around elections is higher than in other months. This monetary supply cycle is consistent with systemic vote buying which requires significant amounts of cash at election times.
- ZEW scientists showed that higher uncertainty as result of the impending hurricane led to less stock trading for Real Estate Investment Trusts that were likely to be affected by the hurricane.
- Using a model of intertemporal procurement as well as survey data collected from procurement consultants, ZEW scientists showed that incomplete contracts do not reduce the buyer's surplus in many procurement projects, because public information is important for procurement and that supplier switching is infrequent.
- In a study, ZEW scientists investigated the role of trade in the employment effects of routine-replacing technological change (RRTC). The analysis shows that RRTC had strong displacement effects, but simultaneously created new jobs and resulted in net employment growth.

ZEW's **research infrastructures** for the scientific community:

The institute operates its own Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) accredited by the German Data Forum (RatSWD). These data are directly used in ZEW's own research projects and are made available to external researchers via ZEW-FDZ:

- The MIP is the German part of the Community Innovation Survey (CIS), a company survey harmonised across EU countries. It comprises information about the innovation activity of German companies in different industries.
- Jointly with IAB, ZEW established the IAB/ZEW Start-up Panel, a research data set for analysis of young firms anywhere in the world.
- The ZEW Financial Market Survey (FMT, since 1991) is a monthly survey monitoring expectations of financial market experts. Based on these data, the ZEW Indicator of Economic Sentiment receives recurrent coverage in German and international media.
- The institute hosts the Mannheim Enterprise Panel (MUP) that comprises data on more than nine million German companies, and contains data on the yearly number of new companies and closures.
- The Business and Economic Research Data Center (BERD@BW) is a cooperative undertaking with the University of Mannheim that provides a centre of excellence for data availability, data exchange and data analysis in the economic sciences. Recently, BERD@NFDI started its activity as part of the National Research Data Infrastructure

(NFDI) supported by BMBF and administered by DFG. ZEW contributes to this infrastructure through its expertise in the anonymisation of unstructured research data.

Over the period 2019-2021, on average 132.7 user agreements with external institutions consisted at any time (thereof 66.7 % for the Mannheim Innovation Panel). On average, 110.3 researchers visited ZEW to access the FDZ-data sets each year.

The target groups for ZEW's **policy advice activities** are public actors in politics and public administration at the European, federal, state and municipal levels as well as at associations and international organisations. In this context, ZEW researchers have

- worked with the European Commission on business taxation and with the European Parliament on the European budget;
- monitored the status of digitalisation as well as the state of innovation for the federal government and supported the states of Baden-Württemberg and North-Rhine Westphalia in developing their digital strategies;
- contributed to the national report on poverty and wealth ("Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht").

In the period between 2019 and 2021, ZEW researchers wrote an average of 123 expert reviews per year. Among these are monthly expert reviews such as the ZEW Financial Market Survey (FMT), the China Economic Panel (CEP) and business cycle tableaus for Germany and the eurozone. While research studies and expert reports on behalf of public actors make up the core of its work, ZEW researchers also participate in parliamentary hearings, in expert talks at German national ministries and the EU Commission. They are members in policy advisory bodies and engage in background conversations. ZEW also works with regulators to design market rules. Examples for ZEW policy advice and its impact are:

- A study on innovative firms to fuel the policy debate surrounding the introduction of an R&D tax credit scheme in Germany, which finally came into force in 2020. As proposed in the paper, the scheme was designed in a way to provide particularly strong incentives for small firms. The ZEW author of the paper was invited several times by the Financial Committee of the German Federal Parliament to discuss design issues of the scheme and likely impacts on Germany's technological performance.
- The project "KitaMatch" applied a concept from matching theory to the allocation of places at German child care centres. Since 2019, according to the institute, the project has allocated over 4,000 day care places using a ZEW open-source software package, reducing waiting times and coordination efforts and increasing transparency and fairness.
- The TOBI project developed a procedure to evaluate company websites with the help of artificial intelligence in order to identify trends in the development of products, services and business models. Based on this project, istari.ai, ZEW's first spinoff company, uses the technology to help organisations monitor and assess the diffusion of innovation and technology.

3. Changes and planning

Development since the previous evaluation

With a new president taking up office in 2016, ZEW started implementing a <u>new research</u> <u>agenda on market design</u>, seeing it as an integrating feature across all its research units. The projects pursued cover topics from energy and labour markets to public procurement markets.

As part of this new orientation, in 2016, ZEW has established a Research Unit "Market Design", focussing on the analysis and optimisation of markets. Since 2019, the implementation is supported by a major increase in institutional funding of 2.1 M€ per year (extraordinary item of expenditure, *großer strategischer Sondertatbestand*). The unit is meant to serve as a competence cluster for methods (auction and matching theory, empirical and experimental market design) and advises market design applications in other units.

- Two professorships were created: one in "Market Design" (2016) in collaboration with the University of Mannheim, and another in "Experimental Market Design" (2021) together with the Karlsruhe Institute of Technology.
- Two junior research groups were established that are focussed on market design: "Public Procurement" (2019) in the Research Unit Corporate Taxation and Public Finance and "Digital Market Design" (2019) in the Research Unit Digital Economy.

Additionally, ZEW has seen <u>changes in leadership personnel</u> for the following units:

- In 2016, the research group "International Distribution and Re-distribution" was transformed into a research unit "Social Security and Distribution". In 2021, the group leader received an ERC Starting Grant, but left ZEW in 2022 for a professorship at Cologne University. As a consequence, the group was re-developed again in 2022 to a research group devoted to "Inequality and Public Policy";
- in 2019, the research unit "International financial markets and financial management" developed into "Pensions and Sustainable Financial Markets";
- in 2019, the research group "Competition and Regulation" was restructured to form the junior research group "Competition and Innovation";
- in 2020, the research unit "Environmental and Resource Economics, Environmental Management" was developed into "Environmental and Climate Economics";
- in 2022, the research unit "Labour Markets, Human Resource Management, and Social Insurance" was developed into "Labour Markets and Social Insurance".

Furthermore, ZEW has induced the following <u>structural changes</u> since the last evaluation:

In 2021, a new research group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy" was created with funding provided by the state of Baden-Württemberg. This group's aim is to gain insights into how the design of health care markets and institutions can be improved. ZEW regards this initiative on health economics as one of particular strategic importance (see below).

Since 2019, ZEW has established four junior research groups (see Chapter 5). These are integrated into existing research units, but they are thematically independent.

In 2020, the Mannheim Institute for Financial Education (MIFE) was founded as a joint institute between the University of Mannheim and ZEW. It is dedicated to comprehensive research on financial literacy and financial education, and it promotes close ties between researchers, policymakers and practitioners in Germany and abroad by offering conferences and workshops.

In order to disseminate research results more efficiently and effectively to the public, ZEW established the strategic service unit "Communications" in 2020. Under the guidance of this unit, the institute used the boost in digitalisation that came with the Covid-19 pandemic to introduce new and cross-channel communications formats. These include the event series #ZEWlive, a compact 60-minute online lunchtime format with a journalist host discussing current economic issues, #ZEWBookTalk in which economists are invited to discuss their latest book releases, and the #ZEWPodcast. In addition, a new publication series, the ZEW expert briefs, was launched.

Strategic work planning for the coming years

In order to increase the scope and breadth of the application of market design methods in society, ZEW aims to create a cross-unit research infrastructure to scale up and expand the use of field experiments. The plan is to establish a research hub, financed with institutional and third-party funding, that contributes to the following goals:

- strengthening economic policy research along the cross-cutting topics of digitisation, climate and energy transition, and European integration;
- working with institutions and companies to develop or improve designs;
- using experimental methods to provide a systematic conceptual framework for the design of rules and institutions that address major economic policy questions while also challenging them in a rigorous cause-and-effect analysis.

With the research hub approach ZEW aims at giving market and programme designers the opportunity to better incorporate behaviourally informed empirical insights from firms, households and other relevant actors when implementing sustainable solutions for markets and institutions in Europe.

Planning for additional funds deriving from institutional funding

Among the objectives of ZEW for the coming years is the establishment of the research group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy" as a full research unit that will pursue three strategic tasks: to build up and exploit new data sources, to build up market design competence for health markets and to build up staffing and expertise to conduct influential research and provide policy advice.

Health economic topics also play an increasingly important role in the core research activities of other ZEW units. Examples include the redistributive effects of health insurance (covered by the research unit "Inequality and Public Policy"); the health effects of climate change ("Environmental and Climate Economics"); health, savings and insurance choices ("Pensions and Sustainable Financial Market"); procurement in the medical sector ("Corporate Taxation and Public Finance"); as well as the interaction between work and health ("Labour Markets and Social Insurance").

The research group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy" will work as a regular ZEW research unit, intensifying the work in the three core research areas currently established. First, the unit will focus on incentives, competition and the design of market structures for the supply of medical services (cooperating, for instance, with the "Market Design" research unit). Second, the unit will focus on the new market for digital health and on methods for evaluating and pricing medical innovations (cooperating, for instance, with the research units "Digital Economy" and the "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics"). Third, the unit will analyse the reimbursement of medical products and services to guide the development of new institutional setups for changing market structures and increasing levels of digitalisation.

After the expansion phase in 2027 and 2028, around 12 researchers will cover the three research areas and will consist of a mix of experts on digital health economics and health care market design and PhD students. Alongside expanding the core team, the unit plans to cooperate with ZEW research associates to expand its network in the European scientific community. In detail, ZEW intends to apply for funding for the following positions: head of research unit (W2/W3 professorship, 1 FTE), postdoctoral researcher (E14, 3 FTE; 1 FTE of which is cross-unit), doctoral researcher (E13, 7 FTE; 2.6 FTE of which are cross-unit), data scientist (E14, 0.5 FTE), assistant (E8, 0.5 FTE), advisor (E13, 0.5 FTE), communication officer (E12, 0.5 FTE).

	_	-	
	2027	2028	Permanently
Own funds + additional funds = "extraordinary item of	€894 k	€1,172 k	€1,410 k
expenditure"			
Own funds from existing funding by institution (at least	€395 k	€403 k	€410 k
3 % of core budget)			
Additional funds of institutional funding	€499 k	€769 k	€1,000 k

"Extraordinary item of expenditure": summary of funds planning

4. Controlling and quality management

Facilities, equipment and funding

Over the years 2018-2020, ZEW's average **annual revenue** was \notin 19.7m. Institutional funding amounted to \notin 12.2m on average. Additional funding from third-party sources included \notin 4.3m from third-party funded project grants (corresponding to 22 % of revenues) and \notin 3.2m from contract research (16 %).

ZEW views the spatial situation within its **building** as adequate for the existing staff and the staff planned for the following years. Regular adaptation and permanent investment into the building structure remain necessary. Facility management is carried out by a team of the "Central Services" service unit, with the support of external specialists.

The most important **third-party funding** sources are the Federal Government (share of third-party funding: 38 % on average), Länder governments (26 %), the Leibniz Association (14 %), and the German Research Foundation (DFG, 8 %). Third-party funded projects include an ERC Starting Grant realised at ZEW between July 2021 and May 2022 as well as two CRCs, in which ZEW participates (see chapter 6). The most important funders for contract research were the Federal Government (share of funding for contract research: 63 %) and industry (17%). For an overview of ZEW's revenue and expenses, see appendix 3.

As part of its **IT-strategy** ZEW aims to provide the technological resources for research with large data sets and machine learning methods. The institute's internal IT-committee is responsible for the development of the IT infrastructure and includes representatives of all research and service units. An internal cloud computing system is available for large statistical calculations. The institute has access to the computer and data centre of the University of Mannheim.

The institute has issued **IT security** guidelines for its employees. IT security threats are constantly monitored. The data protection policy was implemented in 2018 and includes access control to the institute building, transfer protocols, order management, and data protection officer guidelines. All ZEW employees receive online data protection training and instruction on a regular basis.

Organisational and operational structure

The ZEW is organised as a limited liability company (GmbH). It is managed jointly by the Board of Directors, consisting of the president and the administrative director.

The research programme is formed in a combination of top-down and bottom-up processes. In the top-down process, the Board of Directors and the heads of the research units discuss the development and incorporate advice from the Scientific Advisory Council. The bottom-up process includes initiatives from individual or groups of researchers, which are developed further by the Board of Directors and the unit or group heads in monthly jour fixe meetings and semi-annual retreats.

The core agenda for each research unit and the unit's "centre strategy" are developed by the unit. The development of the centre strategies is supported, among other things, through feedback in the meetings of the management and through the Scientific Advisory Council.

The institute has installed a financial controlling system that includes cost and activity accounting. The system provides the unit heads with monthly reports on the current status of personnel, the core budget and third-party funds. The institute has pursued a digitalisation process of its administrative processes for the last years.

Quality Management

In 2022, the guidelines for safeguarding **good scientific practice** were adapted to the current requirements of the Leibniz Association and the German Research Foundation (DFG). Among other aspects, the guidelines regulate responsibility for the management of

career advancement as well as the procedures for scientific misconduct. Every researcher working at ZEW must commit to adhering to the guidelines via a written declaration. ZEW has an internal and an external ombudsperson (one of the ZEW Research Associates).

The institute sees publications in journals with an external referee process as an integral part of its quality criteria. Target publications are defined via the ZEW Journal List. Discussion Papers are reviewed internally and publication must be approved by the respective unit head as well as the ZEW president.

The **allocation of institutional funding** among the individual research units is partly determined on a competitive basis. Each unit receives an equal basic level of funding, Additional funding is then determined on a competitive basis, considering the units' performance in terms of publications, revenue from contract research and research grants, policy work funding acquisitions, and media visibility. Incentive bonuses are granted to researchers for successful publication in journals, for the acquisition of third-party funding and for other extraordinary achievements.

The ZEW Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) and other data resources at ZEW are operated on an **open data policy**. The ZEW-FDZ is accredited by the German Data Forum (RatSWD). Access to the institute's research data for non-commercial scientific purposes is allowed given strict observance of data security and data protection protocols. In order to ensure that research data are quoted correctly, and that the institute's open data sets comply with FAIR data principles, ZEW registers its own research data via digital object identifiers (DOIs) at the "da|ra" platform.

The institute commits to **open access** to quality-assured research results. ZEW adheres to the Berlin Declaration on Open Access to Knowledge in the Sciences and Humanities and the Open Access Policy of the Leibniz Association. An internal Open Access Publication Fund offers financial support to researchers. The institute encourages the open access publication of articles in hybrid journals with which ZEW has an offsetting or publish-and-read agreement. In 2021, 53 % of peer-reviewed publications were available via open access (31 % in 2019).

Quality management by advisory boards and supervisory board

The **Scientific Advisory Council** consists of twelve to 18 members who are appointed by the Supervisory Board. Currently, the SAC has thirteen members. With a change in the Articles of Association that was implemented in 2018, the appointment period was reduced from five to four years. Re-appointments are possible and, according to the Articles of Association, are usually made once. The Council meets twice a year. It reviews the annual programme budget and discusses the research agendas of ZEW's research units. It also debates strategic realignments, such as the establishment of new research areas and ZEW's applications to the Leibniz Competition. One year before each external evaluation, the Council conducts an audit of ZEW that involves additional external reviewers.

The **Supervisory Board** consists of 11 voting members and the chair of the Scientific Advisory Board as a consulting member. According to the Articles of Association, among the voting members shall be three university professors, at least one representative from business and industry, and one representative from each of the responsible ministries of the state of Baden-Württemberg and the federal government. The Board advises and monitors the work of the board of directors, and supervises the overall management of the institute. Its members are appointed by the state of Baden-Württemberg.

5. Human Resources

As of 31 December 2021, ZEW employed 208 people (including four trainees, without student assistants). This corresponds to 173.4 full-time equivalents (FTE), 108.9 of which were assigned to research and scientific services, and 60.5 as science supporting staff (cf. appendix 4 for details).

Leading scientific and administrative positions

Both members of the Board of Directors, the President and the Administrative Director, are appointed by the Supervisory Board for a period of five years, reappointment is possible. The President was appointed in April 2016, the administrative director has held his position since 2004.

Most research unit heads and deputy heads at ZEW, as well as the President, are jointly appointed to W2/W3-professorships with one of the institute's partner universities. Typically, two appointment committees are installed, one at the university, the other at ZEW. Since the last evaluation, six new unit heads have been appointed, five of them to joint professorships.

Staff with a doctoral degree

Since 2019, ZEW offers postdoctoral researchers the opportunity to lead junior research groups. Junior research groups are integrated into existing research units, but they are thematically independent. The topic pursued by the junior research groups can potentially develop into a focus of the entire unit. There are the following junior research groups:

- "Competition and Innovation" in the research unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics"
- "Digital Market Design" in the research unit "Digital Economy"
- "Integration of Migrants and Attitudes towards the Welfare State (IMES)" in the research unit "Labour Markets and Social Insurance"
- "Public Procurement" in the research unit "Corporate Taxation and Public Finance"

ZEW has established three sets of **guidelines for the promotion of postdoctoral researchers** based on the career guidelines of the Leibniz Association. The <u>guidelines for</u> <u>qualification</u> grant access to ZEW's research network and further education opportunities as well as an individual Career Development Committee consisting of ZEW research unit heads, ZEW Research Associates and/or ZEW alumni. This committee conducts a midterm review during the researcher's term at ZEW. The <u>career path of a postdoctoral re-</u> <u>searcher</u> within ZEW is specified in separate guidelines that define the conditions for and benefits of promotion to advanced researcher and then to senior researcher, which is a prerequisite for tenure. The guidelines for the <u>Tenure Merit Review</u> define that every postdoctoral researcher at ZEW has the right to initiate a tenure merit review. The final decision is taken by the board of directors based on the assessment of a tenure merit committee.

Since the last evaluation, seven ZEW postdoctoral researchers went on to be appointed as Professors in Germany or abroad. Other researchers moved on to leadership positions at national and international institutions, such as the German Federal Statistical Office or the World International Property Organisation. The institute monitors the placement of its former employees. Since the last evaluation, the institute expanded the central alumni contact database and plans to use the network for the training of ZEW employees in the future.

Doctoral Candidates

As of 31 December 2021, 66 doctoral candidates worked at ZEW. Since the previous evaluation, the institute has reoriented its doctoral training: Half of the students are enrolled at the Mannheim Graduate School of Economics and Social Sciences (GESS). As part of the "ZEW track" at GESS, doctoral students have to complete one of the two regular **graduate programmes** in economics (CDSE) or business administration (CDSB), which were jointly established by ZEW and the University of Mannheim in 2019. Graduate students in the "ZEW track" typically spend the first year doing regular coursework and then start to work as researchers at ZEW. To enable them to complete their remaining courses at GESS, ZEW offers Summer Courses within the doctoral programmes. Ten ZEW scholarships are provided by the state of Baden-Württemberg for the first year.

The other half of doctoral candidates working at ZEW pursue their PhD at other partner universities (e. g. Heidelberg, KIT, Luxemburg). In its PhD-standards, adopted in 2021, ZEW aims to ensure that they accumulate a comparable set of skills and abilities. Each candidate employed as a ZEW researcher has to pass 60 ECTS in graduate courses at an internationally competitive level. Progress is evaluated yearly by the respective unit heads and, after the first two years of their working contract, by the institute. A coordinator and a dean of graduate studies offer guidance and counselling to PhD students.

Between 2019 and 2021, the average duration for the completion of a doctoral degree at ZEW was 4.5 years. On average, 7.3 doctoral degrees were completed annually over the period 2019-2021 by ZEW employees.

Science supporting staff

Non-scientific employees receive individual training measures and structured further qualification. The ZEW service unit "Seminars and Internal Qualification" conducts special seminars on the topics of leadership, presentation techniques, conducting discussions, conflict resolution and moderation techniques.

Over the period 2019-2021, one person completed a vocational training program as an IT specialist for system integration since the last evaluation. The institute currently employs an apprentice in office management. Each year, an apprentice works for 12 months in the

field of information technology to acquire the university entrance qualification. The service unit "Communications" regularly offers a two-year traineeship position (Volontariat). As of 31 December 2021, a total of 4 apprentices and trainees worked at ZEW.

Equal opportunities and work-life balance

As of 31 December 2021, the proportion of women in "Research and Scientific Services" was 36 %. In terms of individual scientific status groups, 44 % of doctoral students, 21 % of scientists in non-executive positions, 25 % of junior research group leaders, 58 % of deputy unit heads and 22 % of unit heads were women.

The institute encourages applications in the Leibniz Programme of Women Professors and participation in the Leibniz Mentoring Programme for female researchers. Since the last evaluation, five women at ZEW have been appointed professors, thereof two were newly established in 2018 and 2021 with funding from the Leibniz Competition Programme for Women Professors. Since 2012, the institute prepares a Gender Equality Plan every four years, which includes equality goals and measures oriented towards a balanced ratio of women and men in management and decision-making positions.

The institute highlights the increasing importance it attaches to diversity. As of 31 December 2021, two out of four junior research group leaders, three out of 12 deputy unit heads, and 20 % of ZEW doctoral and postdoctoral researchers were non-German.

The 2021 *Code of Conduct on Family Friendliness* sets forth goals and measures regarding the reconciliation of work and family life at ZEW. Measures include trust-based working hours, flexible work-time models, and remote working agreements. ZEW assesses whether the measures help to reconcile work and family life in individual discussions and through regular surveys. The institute received the Total E-Quality certificate in 2015, 2018, and 2021. In 2021, ZEW received the additional Total E-Quality certificate for diversity.

6. Cooperation and environment

Collaboration with universities

ZEW cooperates with universities through **joint appointments** of researchers to professorships. The president of ZEW as well as three heads of research units and two further researchers have been appointed jointly with the University of Mannheim (3 x W3-professorships, 2 x W2, 1 x W1). Three researchers hold professorships at Heidelberg University (1 x W3, 1 x W2, 1 x adj. Professor). Additionally, researchers hold professorships within Germany at Giessen University (W2), KIT (W2), and University of Kassel (W2). Two researchers are appointed to professorships outside of Germany, at the University of Strasbourg (Professeur conventionné) and University of Luxemburg (Honorary professor).

The University of Mannheim is the main local cooperation partner. The cooperation includes the joint doctoral programme (see chapter 5). Members of staff contribute to curricular teaching (courses and seminars) and supervision of bachelor, master, and PhD theses. Cooperation with the University of Mannheim also includes the DFG-funded Collaborative Research Centres (CRC) 884 "The Political Economy of Reforms" (between 2010 and 2022) and CRC-TRR 266 "Accounting for Transparency" (since 2019). Additional collaboration with the university takes place within the Leibniz ScienceCampus MannheimTaxation. MannheimTaxation focusses on European fiscal policy topics and involves 70 researchers from ZEW as well as the School of Law and Economics and the Business School of the University of Mannheim and the Faculty of Law of Heidelberg University. Within the Mannheim Centre for Competition and Innovation (MaCCI), 70 researchers of ZEW and the School of Law and Economics at the University of Mannheim conduct interdisciplinary research on competition, regulation, and innovation policy.

Collaboration with other domestic and international institutions

ZEW is involved in four <u>Leibniz</u> research networks and associations: the research networks "Educational Potentials" (LERN), "Environmental Crisis – Crisis Environments", and "Health Technologies", as well as the Strategy Forum "Open Science".

The institute is a founding member of the European Network for Economic and Fiscal Policy Research (EconPol Europe). EconPol Europe was established in 2017 and includes 14 institutions across 12 countries, which contribute scientific expertise to the discussion of the future design of the European Union. The institute was a part of the GROWINPRO project consortium, funded by Horizon 2020, in which 14 universities and research institutes from nine European countries investigated the causes of the reduced economic growth observed in Europe during the last decades and, in particular, after the Great Recession. Since 2022, ZEW has been involved in a Horizon Europe consortium on welfare systems and labour market policies for economic and social resilience in Europe ("WeLaR").

Within the research programme "Strengthening Efficiency and Competitiveness in the European Knowledge Economies" (SEEK), ZEW worked with 123 partner institutions in 25 countries. Over the duration of the programme which was funded by the state of Baden-Württemberg from 2010 until 2021, 59 research projects were concluded.

International partner institutions include universities in the United States and China, such as Harvard, Stanford, Peking University, and the University of Hong Kong, as well as international organisations such as the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank.

Between 2019 and 2021, a total of 92 <u>guest researchers</u> from Germany and abroad stayed seven days or more at ZEW.

Institution's status in the specialist environment

ZEW points to the other economic research institutes of the Leibniz Association as carrying out comparable activities in terms of breadth and depth, among them specifically the German Institute for Economic Research (DIW), the Leibniz Institute for Economic Research at the University of Munich (ifo), and the Kiel Institute for the World Economy (IfW). Within the community of Leibniz economic research institutes, ZEW sees its specific profile in its leitmotiv of combining the analysis and design of markets and institutions in Europe, its emphasis on the three cross-cutting topics (digitalisation, climate/energy, and European integration) and in the proprietary data, models and institutional expertise of its research units.

At the international level, ZEW sees several institutions as combining activities in a similar way. These include specifically other members of the "European Network for Economic and Fiscal Policy Research" (Econpol Europe), such as the Centre for European Policy Studies (CEPS, Brussels) and the Centre d'Études Prospectives et d'Informations Internationales (CEPII, Paris).

7. Subdivisions of ZEW

Research unit "Pensions and Sustainable Financial Markets"

(8.6 FTE, thereof 2.4 FTE Research and scientific services, 5.2 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 1 FTE Service staff)

The research unit was renamed and re-established under new leadership in January 2019. It focuses on the effects of global trends such as digitalisation, demographic change and climate change on financial markets with the objective of deriving recommendations for the design of sustainable pension systems and financial markets in Europe. The unit's approach combines research in two complementary areas on "Household Finance", i.e. the financial decisions of private households, and "Banks and Financial Intermediation", i.e. the analysis of institutional players such as banks, insurance companies and financial advisors. Thereby, the unit aims for a comprehensive understanding of demand and supply effects on financial markets. Microeconometric analyses and simulation studies are conducted drawing on various data sources, each tailored to the specific requirements of the particular issue at hand. The unit has collected the Financial Market Survey on a monthly basis since 1991. These data are used to publish the ZEW Indicator of Economic Sentiment, a trend indicator for the German economy. Since 2020, the unit runs the Mannheim Institute for Financial Education (MIFE) jointly with the University of Mannheim, which focusses on basic research on financial literacy.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 4 articles in peer-reviewed journals, 5.4 working and discussion papers, and 38.3 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \notin 135k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Federal Government (\notin 35k), Länder governments (\notin 60k), and companies (\notin 25k), while \notin 165k were obtained from contract research. On average, 0,7 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Labour Markets and Social Insurance"

(14.1 FTE, thereof 5.5 FTE Research and scientific services, 7.9 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 0.7 FTE Service staff)

The research unit saw two changes in leadership since the last evaluation. Under a new head since July 2022, it examines institutional frameworks and structural changes of labour markets in Europe and America. The unit analyses labour market outcomes of individuals, firms and regions in four research areas: "Digitalisation and Structural Change",

"Education and Social Mobility", "Health at Work", and "Integration of Migrants and Attitudes towards the Welfare State" (as part of a junior research group). Together with the Institute of Employment Research (IAB), the unit produces data to study the consequences of digitalisation for employment and wages in modern economies. Further, it studies how the Covid-19 pandemic has affected human capital, wages, employment, and infections at the workplace. The unit combines academic research with research-based policy advice and institutional expertise. In terms of methods, the unit employs publicly available micro-data sets, administrative data sets and self-produced surveys that link workers to firm-level data. To analyse causal effects, the unit draws on applied market design, microeconomic and microeconometric tools.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 10 articles in peer-reviewed journals, 13 working and discussion papers per year and 7.7 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \in 835k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Federal Government (\in 430k), the DFG (\in 145k), and the Leibniz Association competition procedure (\in 100k), while \in 125k were obtained from contract research. On average, 1,3 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Digital Economy"

(16.5 FTE, thereof 6 FTE Research and scientific services, 9 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 1.5 FTE Service staff)

The research unit measures digitalisation and its impact in Germany and Europe. It examines the diffusion of new digital technologies and the expansion of digital infrastructure as well as the effects of digitalisation on production, innovation and the workplace. It investigates how digital markets and platforms function, how they change the design of existing markets, and how they are affected by policy measures. It also develops design options for optimally exploiting the potential of digitalisation. In 2019, the research unit established the junior research group "Digital Market Design" as part of the extraordinary item of expenditure ("Sondertatbestand"). With its specific expertise in the digital economy, this agenda supports ZEW's leitmotif of studying and designing well-performing markets and institutions in Europe. The research unit analyses data collected from inhouse company surveys, from company websites and internet platforms as well as administrative panel data and macroeconomic databases. Survey experiments and field experiments as well as machine learning and econometric methods belong to the research unit's toolkit. The unit's research agenda reflects the ubiquitous impact of digitalisation on different areas of the economy. Policy advice is provided on current topics such as the impact of companies' level of digitalisation on their resilience to crises as well as digital sovereignty.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 7.3 articles in peer-reviewed journals per year, 7.6 working and discussion papers, and 15.7 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \notin 375k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Federal Government (\notin 185k), Länder governments (\notin 160k), and the DFG (\notin 8k), while \notin 725k were obtained from contract research. On average, 0.3 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics"

(24.4 FTE, thereof 10.1 FTE Research and scientific services, 11.3 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 3.1 FTE Service staff)

The research unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics" conducts microeconometric analyses of firm innovation as well as of start-ups and young firms in Germany and Europe. Its research output is based on a combination of large-scale research data sets, up-to-date analytical methods and a close link to new developments in the economics of innovation and firm dynamics. The unit conducts the official innovation survey for Germany (the Mannheim Innovation Panel, or MIP), which has been Germany's contribution to the Community Innovation Surveys of the European Commission since 1993. For startup research, the unit provides the IAB/ZEW Start-up Panel. Both surveys are based on the Mannheim Enterprise Panel (MUP), which provides information about inter-firm linkages and firm-specific solvency. The unit aims to combine academic research and scientific advisory projects in the field of innovation and entrepreneurship with the advancement and maintenance of this research infrastructure. The junior research group "Competition and Innovation" conducts theoretical and empirical research on the link between competition and innovation, including the design of markets for technology. The research unit is closely involved in the Mannheim Centre for Competition and Innovation (MaCCI, jointly with the University of Mannheim). ZEW's Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) is part of this research unit.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 14.7 articles in peer-reviewed journals per year, 23 working and discussion papers as well as 31.3 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \notin 615k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Federal Government (\notin 215k), Länder governments (\notin 180k), and the EU (\notin 175k), while \notin 1.3m were obtained from contract research. On average, 1.3 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Market Design"

(11.2 FTE, thereof 6 FTE Research and scientific services, 4.8 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 0.5 FTE Service staff)

The research unit was newly established in 2016 following the last evaluation. It focuses on the analysis and optimisation of markets. Its aim is to improve the performance of existing markets and create new marketplaces by actively shaping their rules. The research unit concentrates on research areas that are geared towards the two fundamental categories of markets: The research area "Auction Market Design" deals with the analysis and design of markets with prices (auctions). The research area "Auction Market Design" deals with the analysis and design of auction markets. Examples include the public support of renewables, procurement, the sale of government bonds and the allocation of mobile radio frequencies. The research area "Design of Matching Markets" focuses on the analysis and design of markets in which supply and demand are not coordinated exclusively by price. Allocation rules are nevertheless based on the personal preferences of the market participants. Examples include the sharing economy, as well as education and labour markets, where two sides must choose each other without a flexible pricing system. The unit applies microtheoretical models complemented by experimental and empirical methods to validate the rules developed. In its policy work, the research unit works directly with market managers to analyse existing problems and implement new rules. Specifically, the unit takes the market design approach to public authorities that do not have large consulting budgets. Its mission is to improve market design in the public sector for the common good.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 6.7 articles in peer-reviewed journals per year, 6.7 working and discussion papers and 8 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \in 255k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Leibniz Association competition procedure (\in 110k), the Federal Government (\in 90k), and foundations (\in 35k), while \in 75k were obtained from contract research. On average, 0.7 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Environmental and Climate Economics"

(14.3 FTE, thereof 9.3 FTE Research and scientific services, 3 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 2 FTE Service staff)

The unit is under new leadership since August 2020. It analyses how climate- and energyrelated markets and policies should be designed to be environmentally effective, economically efficient and socially balanced. The unit uses empirical and quantitative approaches to understand cause-and-effect relationships based on applied economic theory, econometrics and behavioural and experimental economics. A core theme of the unit's policy relevant work is the transition to climate neutrality, with an emphasis on international cooperation in climate protection, sustainable behaviour at firms and in households, the provision of carbon-neutral energy and economy-wide decarbonisation. With its expertise in environmental and climate economics, the unit contributes to ZEW's mission of analysing and designing well-performing markets and institutions in Europe.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 11.7 articles in peer-reviewed journals per year, 15.6 working and discussion papers and 5.7 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \notin 945k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Federal Government (\notin 675k), Länder governments (\notin 150k), and foundations (\notin 60k), while \notin 85k were obtained from contract research. On average, 3.3 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research unit "Corporate Taxation and Public Finance"

(15.2 FTE, thereof 7.1 FTE Research and scientific services, 6.8 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 1.4 FTE Service staff)

The unit's research agenda is centred on corporate taxation and empirical public economics in the context of European integration. Its overarching research topics relate to the design of international corporate tax systems and to the architecture of European fiscal institutions. The units' researchers carry out research on the EU budget and on EU fiscal governance institutions such as European fiscal rules. This agenda supports ZEW's guiding mission of studying and designing well-performing markets and institutions in Europe with a specific focus on tax and fiscal policies. The unit sees the collaboration of researchers working on business taxation and public economics as its central feature by combining knowledge of corporate taxation and effective tax rate simulation models with a special expertise on the EU budget, European public procurement and fiscal governance. The unit's groups share interest in key methods in microeconometrics and causal identification designs, including survey and field experiments. A further cross-cutting interest is the political economy of fiscal decision-making, including research on the fiscal preferences of voters and politicians. The research unit is closely tied to the Leibniz ScienceCampus MannheimTaxation. It contributes to European fiscal policy debates through its academic publications, its policy advice and media appearances.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 11.7 articles in peer-reviewed journals, 20.7 working and discussion papers and 16 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \in 505k over the same period and were obtained mostly from Länder governments (\notin 180k), the Leibniz Association competition procedure (\notin 165k), and the DFG (\notin 145k), while \notin 385k were obtained from contract research. On average, 2 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research group "Inequality and Public Policy"

(12.1 FTE, thereof 4.4 FTE Research and scientific services, 6.8 FTE Doctoral candidates, and 0.9 FTE Service staff)

The research group is under new leadership since June 2022. It analyses the design and distributional effects of public policies in Europe using simulation methods and microeconometric research designs as well as survey and field experiments. The group is organised into three research areas: "Distributional Effects of Taxes and Transfers", "Measurement of Inequality", and "Inequality and Demography", including gender aspects of inequality and, more broadly, the interplay between inequality and demographic factors such as fertility, migration and population ageing. It focusses on tax-benefit microsimulation and family economics and frequently advises policymakers on the design of taxes and transfers based on its ZEW-EviSTA model. Its approach in the measurement of inequality and redistribution includes the incorporation of in-kind transfers and the adoption of a lifecycle perspective. Policy advisory projects include an analysis of the price effects of the temporary cut of the value added tax in 2020, a study for the 6th Poverty and Wealth Report ("Armuts- und Reichtumsbericht") and an investigation of the distributional implications of party platforms during the German federal election campaign in 2021. Currently, the group is involved in a Horizon Europe project that studies how the design of welfare states can respond to various economic and societal challenges.

Over the period 2019-2021, the work led to on average 3.7 articles in peer-reviewed journals, 8.3 working and discussion papers and 4.3 expert reviews per year. Average yearly project grants amounted to \notin 325k over the same period and were obtained mostly from the Leibniz Association competition procedure (\notin 155k), Länder governments (\notin 90), foundations (\notin 45k), and the EU (\notin 25k), while \notin 115k were obtained from contract research. On average, 2.7 doctoral degrees were completed per year.

Research group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy"

(2.3 FTE, thereof 1 FTE Research and scientific services and 1.3 FTE Doctoral candidates)

The group was first established in 2021 as a project group and became a research group in April 2022. Its research is centred on the identification of current challenges in health care markets and the evaluation of health care policies. In the empirical research projects, the group focuses on market structures and reimbursement in health care as well as the opportunities and challenges of digital health. Insights based on different data sources, from survey and administrative data commonly used in health economic research to data from experiments, web scraping, ZEW's Mannheim Enterprise Panel (MUP) and the Mannheim Innovation Panel (MIP), can help health policymakers in shaping, and the general population in judging, health care market reforms.

In 2021, the work led to 1 article in peer-reviewed journals and the unit published 2 expert reviews. Its project grants amounted to \notin 170k and were obtained from the government of Baden-Württemberg. \notin 10k were obtained from contract research.

8. Handling of recommendations from the previous evaluation

ZEW responded as follows to the 7 recommendations of the last external evaluation (highlighted in italics, see also statement of the Senate of the Leibniz Association issued on 14 March 2012, pages B-3/B-4):

1) From the point of view of the review board, the focus ["Market Design"] introduced by the new president could significantly strengthen the research profile of ZEW and represents an important, very beneficial strategic expansion of the institute. It is recommended that the initial considerations in this regard be quickly translated into concrete plans and reviewed by the Scientific Advisory Council. On this basis, a corresponding extraordinary item of expenditure ("Sondertatbestand") can then be applied for.

ZEW applied for an extraordinary item of expenditure regarding "Market Design", which was approved in the official procedure by the Leibniz Association and the German Science Council in 2018. Details on the implementation are provided in Chapter 3. The Research Unit "Market Design" is described in Chapter 7.

2) ZEW's considerations to perpetuate the research groups "International Distribution and Redistribution" and "Competition and Regulation", which currently receive start-up funding by the state of Baden-Württemberg and to expand these into a research units in the future are welcomed. The Executive Directors should quickly present a concrete plan for this and have it reviewed by the Scientific Advisory Council. On this basis, a corresponding extraordinary item of expenditure ("Sondertatbestand") can then be applied for.

Following departures of the heads of both research groups in 2016 and 2018, they changed focus (see chapter 3). They currently continue as the research group "Inequality and Public Policy" and the junior research group "Competition and Innovation".

3) It is equally positive that it is planned to appoint two professors in a joint process with Heidelberg University as heads of the two newly created research units ["Environment" and "Energy"]. This opportunity should be used to increase the proportion of women in scientific management positions at ZEW.

The plans to split the previous unit "Environmental and Resource Economics, Environmental Management" into two separate units were not implemented. Instead, with a newly appointed head, the unit was refocused to "Environmental and Climate Economics" in 2022. The new head and the two deputy heads, thereof one a newly recruited female researcher, are jointly appointed to W3/W2 professorships.

4) In future, it will be important to establish new partnerships and cooperative relationships at the European level from a strategic point of view.

ZEW points to two new professorships with the universities of Luxembourg and Strasbourg since the last evaluation as well as to 380 partners worldwide, about half of them outside Germany as evidence for its international network. A particularly important partnership is the European Network for Economic and Fiscal Policy Research (EconPol Europe), established in 2017. Further details are provided in chapter 6.

5) Here [in the proportion of female academic staff at management level], despite personnel changes, no increase has been achieved since the previous evaluation. This is highly regrettable. Among the scientific staff as a whole, the proportion of women has even decreased since then. ZEW must involve more women in research. To this end, the Institute must actively search for suitable female candidates in advance of upcoming appointment procedures and encourage them to apply.

ZEW points to various measures to increase the share of female staff in research, especially at management level. In all appointment procedures, intensive and proactive efforts are made to improve the proportion of women in management positions. Female candidates are consistently approached directly; the equal opportunities officer is integrated in all appointments to management positions. All research units now have either a female head or a female deputy head. Since the last evaluation, five female researchers were appointed to professorships (thereof two Leibniz-professorships).

6) ZEW would like to establish a scholarship programme for students to participate in the university economics programme CDSE in the first year of their doctoral studies. The curriculum shall be geared to the specific requirements of working in ZEW's more application-oriented research and policy advisory projects. From the second year onwards, the doctoral students are to receive employment contracts at the Institute. In order to implement these plans, the Institute would like to apply for additional funds as part of a special purpose grant. Specifically, it is planned to award 25 scholarships per year at €1,400 per month (including overhead costs approx. €570,000 p.a.). In addition, a programme coordination position is to be established (approx. €130,000 p.a.). According to ZEW, the total costs will amount to about €700,000 per year. In the view of the review board, the scholarship programme is a sensible measure that enables ZEW to compete internationally for highly qualified junior staff and to train them in the best possible way. It will also further

improve the quality of work at ZEW. However, additional funds to finance a position to be set up specifically for programme coordination are not considered necessary.

Since 2019, 10 scholarships are offered each year for doctoral students with funding by the state of Baden-Württemberg. Details on the graduate programme are provided in chapter 5.

7) With regard to the duration of membership in this committee [ZEW's Scientific Advisory Council], it is expected that in future the guidelines published by the Senate of the Leibniz Association regarding the "Organisation and Tasks of the Leibniz Institutes' Scientific Advisory Boards" will be observed. Furthermore, it is recommended that the proportion of advisory council members from abroad be increased.

The number of members of the Scientific Advisory Council was reduced from 18 in 2015 to 13 in 2022. In ZEW's Articles of Association, which have been in force since 2018, the duration of the Advisory Council membership was determined. New members typically spend two terms lasting four years each.

In addition, since the 2016 evaluation, new female members have been appointed. In the current composition, all of ZEW's substantive research fields are covered by internationally recognised experts.

Organisational Chart



Publications and expert reviews

	Period				
	2019 2020 202				
Total number of publications					
Monographs	2	0	3		
Individual contributions to edited volumes	9	12	12		
Articles in peer-reviewed journals	67	50	83		
Articles in other journals	16	20	13		
ZEW Discussion Papers	55	74	83		
External working and discussion papers	26	21	25		

	2019	2020	2021
Number of expert reviews	117	137	115

Revenue and Expenditure

			2019			:	2020			2021			
	Revenue	€k	%	%		€k	%	%	€k	%	%		
Tota	revenue (sum of I., II. and III.; excluding DFG fees)	20,256			2	21,310			21,407				
I.	Revenue (sum of I.1.; I.2., and I.3.)	19,003	100 %		19	9,761	100 %		20,318	100 %			
1. 1.1	Institutional Funding (excluding construction pro- jects and acquisition of property) Institutional funding (excluding construction pro- jects and acquisition of property) by Federal and	11,975 11,975	63%			2,226 2,226	62 %		12,422 12,422	61%			
2.	Länder governments according to AV-WGL Revenue from project grants	4,041	21 %	100 %	_	1,108	21 %	100 %	4,621	23 %	100 %		
2.	DFG	., .	21 /0	9%	-	.,	21/0	7%	308	25 %	7%		
2.1	Leibniz Association (competitive procedure)	352 350	-	9%		304 477		12 %	932		20 %		
2.2	Federal government	1,483		37 %		1,513		37 %	1,908		41%		
	thereof: Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF)	1,074	-	5778		1,122		57 10	1,031		7170		
2.4	Land government (State of Baden-Württemberg)	1,040		26 %	1,	1,270		31 %	1,044		23 %		
2.5	EU	371		9%		151		4 %	182		4 %		
2.6	Industry	123		3 %		154		4 %	104		2 %		
2.7	Foundations	322		8 %	:	239		6 %	144		3 %		
3.	Revenue from contract research	2,987	16 %	100 %	3	3,427	17 %	100 %	3,275	16 %	100 %		
3.1	Federal government (BMBF, BMAS, BMF)	1,677		56 %	2	2,151		63 %	2,254		69 %		
3.2	Länder governments	251		8 %		237		7 %	195		6 %		
3.3	EU	129		4 %	:	240		7 %	126		4 %		
3.4	Industry	702		24 %	:	586		17 %	392		12 %		
3.5	Foundations	228		8 %		213		6 %	308		9 %		
11.	Miscellaneous revenue (e. g. membership fees, donations, rental income, funds drawn from re- serves)	1,253			1,	1, 549			1,089				
	thereof: Funds drawn from reserves (Leibniz-competition)	158				76			285				
ш.	Revenue for construction projects (institutional funding by Federal and Länder governments, EU structural funds, etc.)												
	Expenditures		€k		-		€k			€k			
Expe	nditures (excluding DFG fees)	ек 20,256			_	21,310			21,407				
1.	Personnel		13,038				4,204			14,799			
2.	Material expenses		1,095				1,562			1,339			
3.	Equipment investments		392				476			411			
4.	Other operating expenses (e.g. depreciation, maintenance, licences, energy costs)		5,731			5	,068			4,857			
4.1	thereof: Third party services		1,258			1,185 1,427							
4.2	thereof: Membership dues, charges		729			778			800				
4.3	thereof: Professional fees		425 292				207						
4.4	thereof: Travel expenses		424			92			59				
4.5	thereof: Literature and data		381				317			399			
	fees (if paid for the institution - 2.5 % of revenue institutional funding)		292				297			302			

Staff

(Basic financing and third-party funding	/ proportion of women	(as of: 31 December 2021)
		·

		e equiva- nts	Employees		Female e	mployees
	Total	On third- party funding	Total	On tem- porary con- tracts	Total	On tem- porary con- tracts
Research and scientific	Number	Percent	Number	Percent	Number	Percent
services	108.9	49	131	84	47	85
1 st level (scientific director)	1.0	0	1	100	0	0
2 nd level (unit heads)	9.0	32	9	22	2	50
3 rd level (deputy unit heads)	10.8	51	12	17	7	29
Junior research group heads	3.8	50	4	100	1	100
Scientists in non-executive posi- tions	28.1	54	39	90	8	88
Doctoral candidates	56.21	50	66	100	29	100
Science supporting staff in research units	11	18	15			
from E13, senior service	2.0	33	3			
E9 to E12, upper-mid-level ser- vice	3.6	36	4			
E5 to E8, mid-level service	5.4	0	8			
Other science supporting staff	49.5	0	58			
Managing Director	1.0	0	1			
General Services						
from E13, senior service	8.7	0	9			
E9 to E12, upper-mid-level ser- vice	15.9	0	18			
E5 to E8, mid-level service	3.4	0	4			
Communication		-				
from E13, senior service	7.0	0	7			
E9 to E12, upper-mid-level ser- vice	8.1	0	13			
E5 to E8, mid-level service	0.5	0	1			
Management supporting staff						
from E13, senior service	3.0	0	3			
E9 to E12, upper-mid-level ser- vice	1.9	0	2			
Student assistants	20.0	25	87			
Apprentices / Trainees	4.0	0	4			

Inter- national staff
Total
Number
26
0
0
3
2
7
14

Annex B: Evaluation Report

ZEW - Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research, Mannheim

Contents

Summary and main recommendations	В-2
Overall concept, activities and results	В-4
Changes and planning	В-6
Controlling and quality management	В-7
Human Resources	B-10
Cooperation and environment	B-12
Subdivisions of ZEW	B-13
Handling of recommendations of the last external evaluation	B-18
	Overall concept, activities and results Changes and planning Controlling and quality management Human Resources Cooperation and environment Subdivisions of ZEW

Appendix:

Members of review board and guests; Representatives of collaborative partners and the Scientific Advisory Board

1. Summary and main recommendations

The ZEW – Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research investigates the institutional framework of markets and their functioning, particularly emphasizing the conditions for technological change, innovation, and competitiveness in Europe. ZEW successfully combines research activities with policy advice to government bodies and organisations at the national and international levels.

ZEW regularly and continuously produces important research results, which are widely received in the scientific community both nationally and internationally. A substantial number of articles are published in highly visible journals. The institute collects unique datasets, including datasets on business and innovation activity within Germany, which are made available for external use through the ZEW Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ). Its activities are of high relevance for policymakers. The institute conducts numerous transfer activities and maintains close links to stakeholders and institutions. ZEW's transfer strategy coherently links its research activities to policy advice and knowledge transfer and is facilitated very effectively by the science-supporting units. Five of the institute's research units are rated as "excellent". It is noteworthy that in 2019, a start-up company was founded.

Since the last evaluation, the institute has developed very well. With a new president taking office shortly after the evaluation visit and six new research unit and group leaders, ZEW has seen a dynamic development. Its research approach has been advanced coherently by the establishment of market design as an area of expertise, beginning in 2016 and permanently financed from 2019 onwards by an extraordinary item of expenditure.

The institute is led very capably by the president and the managing director. It has implemented appropriate measures for quality management and achieves a good level of openaccess publications. For the coming years, the institute has presented highly promising plans to continue the development of market design and to expand the use of field experiments at the institute.

ZEW cooperates closely with local universities. Six researchers are jointly appointed with the University of Mannheim and three hold professorships at Heidelberg University. Earlycareer researchers receive very good training and many move on to leadership positions at research institutions or to governmental roles in Germany and beyond. The opportunities for doctoral students have been further developed since the last evaluation in collaboration with the University of Mannheim. The institute has a structured and transparently organised tenure process.

Special consideration should be given to the following main comments and recommendations in the evaluation report (highlighted in **bold face** in the text):

Overall concept, activities and results (Chapter 2)

1. The institute pursues a "Centre Strategy", according to which each ZEW research unit develops its own profile. As envisioned by this strategy, the units maintain strong ex-

pertise in their respective topics and have advanced their reputation since the last evaluation, both within the academic community and for policy advice. Within ZEW, the units cooperate closely on innovative research projects on a case-by-case basis. The institute's strategy to further extend the application of the market design approach to different fields has the potential to lead to further cross-unit collaboration and advance the international visibility of ZEW's core research profile.

Changes and planning (Chapter 3)

2. ZEW plans to install a permanent research unit on "Health Care Markets and Health Policy" from 2027 onwards financed by a permanent extraordinary item of expenditure of € 1.4m (of which € 1m will be in additional funding and € 0.4m from the institute's existing budget). The plans for a research unit of around 13 FTE are well thought through and academically innovative, addressing important societal questions and aimed at filling gaps in data availability. These plans are expressly endorsed. The envisioned focus of the research unit builds very well on ZEW's market design approach. It exploits complementarities with other ZEW units and with other research institutes in Germany working on health economics. When submitting the proposal, ZEW should further specify the academic job profiles for the additional positions.

Controlling and quality management (Chapter 4)

- 3. It is good to see that ZEW plans to improve the accessibility of the datasets administered at the Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) by allowing remote access through the statistical offices of the *Länder*. If necessary, the institute should aim to obtain external funding in order to finance the development of remote data access options. Further improving the accessibility of datasets will increase the number of users and publications based on ZEW's unique datasets, thereby enhancing ZEW's visibility. It is welcomed that the institute monitors the use of the Mannheim Innovation Panel for research publications. This system should be extended to other datasets.
- 4. To avoid potential conflicts of interest, researchers who cooperate closely with ZEW should not be members of the Scientific Advisory Council (SAC). Out of the 13 members of the SAC, only two come from institutions outside of Germany. ZEW should use upcoming appointments to increase the number of members coming from abroad, as was already recommended at the last evaluation.

The SAC conducts an audit between evaluations, in which ZEW's overall structures and strategies are examined conscientiously and constructively. To fulfil the audit's objective, it should be conducted in the middle between two evaluations, as proposed by the Senate of the Leibniz-Association.

Human resources (Chapter 5)

5. At the academic leadership level (president and heads of research units and research groups), the proportion of women has increased from one out of eight in 2014 (13 %) to two out of ten in 2021 (20 %). With the appointment of a new female head of the Research Unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics" in 2023, the proportion has improved further. ZEW should continue on its path and aim for having more

female researchers and women in leadership positions than is otherwise the case in the discipline.

Cooperation and environment (Chapter 6)

6. Through various research projects, ZEW's research units maintain close relationships with many international partners. As was already recommended in the previous evaluation, the institute should expand its institutional network at the European and international levels from a strategic point of view and build formal partnerships independent of researchers' or research units' personal ties to increase its institutional visibility.

2. Overall concept, activities and results

The ZEW – Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research analyses the institutional framework of markets in Europe and their functioning. Its research focus is on which institutions and economic policies are needed to reach socially desirable outcomes, with a particular emphasis on the conditions for technological change, innovation, and competitiveness. ZEW combines research activities with policy advice to government bodies and organisations at the national and international level. One area of particular expertise is applied microeconometrics, where ZEW researchers combine high-quality datasets, often collected or administered at the institute itself, with state-of-the-art methods for causal identification.

The institute pursues a "Centre Strategy", according to which each ZEW research unit develops its own profile. As envisioned by this strategy, the units maintain strong expertise in their respective topics and have advanced their reputation since the last evaluation, both within the academic community and for policy advice. Within ZEW, the units cooperate closely on innovative research projects on a caseby-case basis. The institute's strategy to further extend the application of the market design approach to different fields (see Chapter 3) has the potential to lead to further cross-unit collaboration and advance the international visibility of ZEW's core research profile.

Results

Research

ZEW regularly produces high-quality **research results**, which receive international attention in the scientific community. It is good to see that the visibility of ZEW's results has further increased since the last evaluation, with a substantial number of articles published in highly visible journals, even though the total number of publications has decreased. The institute's research units also regularly publish in their respective relevant international field journals in economics and business science, and, more importantly, in high-quality general interest journals in economics. The instruments implemented by the institute adequately support this coherent publication strategy to maintain and even further increase the quality and visibility of ZEW's research.

Research Infrastructure

ZEW collects important **datasets** for the community. The Mannheim Enterprise Panel (MUP) and the Mannheim Innovation Panel (MIP) are highly significant for research on firm and innovation activities. Among other important aspects, the MUP contains data on the yearly number of new companies and firm closures. In contrast, the MIP contains information on the innovation expenditure and introduction of new products by German companies in different industries. Along with several other datasets, such as the IAB/ZEW start-up panel, MUP and MIP are hosted at the ZEW Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) and can be accessed by external researchers on site. As planned, the institute should implement remote access possibilities to the datasets stored at FDZ, which is expected to increase the number of data users also from abroad (see Chapter 4).

In recent years, the institute has further expanded its datasets. With the ongoing creation of the IAB-ZEW linked employee-employer data, which combines existing datasets at ZEW with the employee panel at IAB, the institute provides a new dataset well-suited to fill deficits in data for research on the German labour market. The institute has also extended its methodological portfolio for data collection by generating web-scraped data. The institute's efforts to continuously improve, expand and diversify its datasets to meet the rapidly changing requirements for innovative research are highly appreciated.

Transfer

Many of ZEW's research activities have considerable potential for societal **impact**. One prime example is the project *KitaMatch*, which developed an open-source software package that allows for implementing a matching algorithm to improve the allocation process for places at child care centres. Another example is a study on the transparency of hotel booking platforms, which the European Parliamentary Research Service picked up in their study on the Digital Services Act. The institute pursues a coherent strategy to further increase the impact of its research by continuously building relationships with policymakers through projects and organising events aimed at political actors, such as the ZEW Lunch Debates in Brussels. These efforts have laid the foundations for its success in having its expertise heard by policymakers.

Through reports and expert reviews, ZEW researchers regularly provide **expertise** to state and national governments, EU institutions, and other political actors. In recent years, these have included an expert review on effective tax levels for the European Union Directorate General TAXUD and input for the German federal government's national Report on Poverty and Wealth. ZEW regularly publishes expert reviews on specific questions in individual sectors of the economy, such as the monthly ZEW Financial Market Report, which provides a timely analysis of the financial sector and receives recurrent media attention.

Additionally, ZEW scientists are members of several **commissions** that advise policymakers. At the federal level, these include the Commission of Experts for Research and Innovation (EFI), the *Rat der Arbeitswelt* of the Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, and the Monopolies Commission.

It is worth noting that in 2019, a start-up **company** was founded based on a joint project with Giessen University. It uses artificial intelligence to help organisations monitor and assess innovation and technology diffusion.

3. Changes and planning

Development since the previous evaluation

Since the last evaluation, ZEW has seen a **dynamic development** of its research units. Six of the nine current unit and group leaders have taken up their position since the last evaluation. These changes were managed very well and led to a productive reorientation towards new topics that is already bearing fruit. Based on these excellent developments, the units have the potential for even greater visibility and impact as their respective research agendas are implemented further (see Chapter 7 for details on the units).

The new president, a renowned scientist, took office at the time of the last evaluation visit in 2016. The plans he introduced then for a new research field on "design of markets and institutions", focussing on how optimally functioning markets and allocation mechanisms can be designed and developed to achieve the best societal outcomes, were well received. Subsequently, ZEW applied for additional institutional funding as part of an extraordinary item of expenditure (großer strategischer Sondertatbestand) to further expand the implementation of **market design** in the institute's research agenda. The plans were assessed positively by the German Science and Humanities Council (WR; Wissenschaftsrat) and, since 2019, ZEW has been receiving additional institutional funding of \in 2.1m annually (equivalent to 27 FTE staff positions). The institute has since established the "Market Design" research unit and two junior research groups. The methods complement ZEW's extensive expertise in analysing markets and institutions. They are applied to various topics in successfully established projects in other ZEW research units. In this process, the new research unit "Market Design" links ZEW units by providing methodological expertise. This expertise also includes the supervision of doctoral students. In this approach, ZEW has found a highly suitable and excellently implemented structure that allows its different, thematically focussed research units to apply market design approaches to research projects across multiple fields.

Strategic work planning for the coming years

As the initial work on market design was focussed on theoretical approaches, it makes sense that ZEW now aims to further expand its expertise in implementing and applying market design methods, especially in behavioural and experimental economics. In a cross-unit **research hub**, ZEW aims, on the one hand, to provide expertise to support researchers in the running of field experiments and, on the other, to establish a central contact point for firms and institutions. These plans offer highly promising opportunities to develop ZEW's market design approach further and to increase the impact of its research through application-oriented projects.

Planning for additional funds deriving from institutional funding

From 2021, ZEW established research on **health care markets** as a new topic, organised in a new group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy". First established as a project group, the group continued from 2022 onwards as an independent research group with project funding provided by the State of Baden-Württemberg. ZEW plans to further extend its research on health care markets and health policy by analysing questions related to the market structures for the supply of medical services, digital health and innovation, and reimbursement for medical products and services. Currently, these topics are being developed at ZEW in the temporary research group and through health-related projects pursued across different ZEW research units. ZEW plans to install a permanent research unit on "Health Care Markets and Health Policy" from 2027 onwards financed by a permanent extraordinary item of expenditure of € 1.4m (of which € 1m will be in additional funding and € 0.4m from the institute's existing budget). The plans for a research unit of around 13 FTE are well thought through and academically innovative, addressing important societal questions and aimed at filling gaps in research and data availability. These plans are expressly endorsed. The envisioned focus of the research unit builds very well on ZEW's market design approach. It exploits complementarities with other ZEW units and with other research institutes in Germany working on health economics. When submitting the proposal, ZEW should further specify the academic job profiles for the additional positions.

4. Controlling and quality management

Facilities, equipment and funding

Between 2019 and 2021, ZEW's institutional funding totalled on average \in 12.2m per year which is sufficient to cover ZEW's current portfolio of activities. This institutional funding has increased significantly since the last evaluation due to an extraordinary item of expenditure (*Sondertatbestand*) for implementing market design (see Chapter 3).

Over the same period, ZEW obtained on average 38 % of its budget from **third-party funding** through project grants (\in 4.3m per year) and contract research (\in 3.2m per year). This level has reduced since the last evaluation, but is still high. The majority of funding is obtained from the federal <u>ministries</u> (with the Ministry of Education and Research, the Ministry for Economic Affairs and Climate Action, the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, and the Ministry of Finance being the most important funders) and *Länder* governments (mostly from the State of Baden-Württemberg, but also from North Rhine-Westphalia and Brandenburg). Since the last evaluation, <u>EU funding</u> lines have been giving less attention to topics such as industrial economics and, as a result, the EU funding obtained by ZEW has reduced. The institute should aim to increase the funding obtained from the EU again. It is appreciated that the institute pursues contract research projects for the EU with lower funding budgets, strengthening the institute's ties to policymakers and institutions at the European level. <u>DFG-funding</u> is at a similar level to the last evaluation. The institute should maintain DFG-funding at a level that is at least equal to the DFG fees.

The institute's offices are located in central Mannheim, in a building owned by ZEW itself. The agreement between ZEW and its funding institutions regarding the ownership of the **building** has proved very helpful for the institute.

ZEW has appropriate IT-facilities at its disposal and has access to the computer and data centre of the University of Mannheim. The institute has issued IT security guidelines and monitors security threats. All employees receive data protection training and regular instruction.

Organisational and operational structure

ZEW's organisational structures are appropriate. The president and the managing director are jointly responsible for the **management** of the institute, while each of the research units develops its "centre strategy" for research and policy advice. The seven large research units and two smaller research groups establish their specific profile. The instrument of research groups is used as a strategic tool to develop new topics or re-orient groups.

Institutional funding is allocated to ZEW's research units based on a fixed number of researcher positions (awarded regardless of performance) and a performance-based component. The performance-based **funding allocation system** considers the publication output, success in third-party funding acquisition, policy consulting, transfer activities, and other extraordinary achievements. Every year, the allocation of funding to the units is recalculated. The intention to provide more resources to the most productive units is welcomed. However, the institute should ensure that the funding allocation system provides adequate incentives for all types of activity (research, transfer, development and operation of research infrastructures) and that the units still realise their full potential of obtaining third-party funding.

ZEW's transfer strategy is facilitated very effectively by ZEW's **science-supporting units**, including the communication department and the events team. These take on important roles such as identifying topics that are strategically well-suited for building relationships with policymakers, and help implement the institute's "centre strategy" (see Chapter 2).

Quality management

The institute has implemented appropriate measures for quality management. To monitor the publication performance of its research units, the institute uses a ZEW **journal list** based on the most visible publication outlets in economics and business studies according to the standard ranking in the profession. For ZEW's purposes, the list is complemented by up to five of the most visible field journals in each of the research areas in which ZEW's units are active.

The institute's commitment to **open-access** publications is appreciated. Its researchers are encouraged to publish in hybrid journals with which ZEW has an offsetting or publish-and-read agreement. Since 2020, the institute has operated an Open Access Publication Fund. With 53 % of published articles by ZEW researchers in 2021 being available via open access, the institute has reached a good level. The efforts to further increase the

share of open-access publications in journals with high quality-standards should be continued.

It is good to see that ZEW plans to improve the accessibility of the datasets administered at the Research Data Centre (ZEW-FDZ) by allowing remote access through the statistical offices of the *Länder*. If necessary, the institute should aim to obtain external funding in order to finance the development of remote data access options. Further improving the accessibility of datasets will increase the number of users and publications based on ZEW's unique datasets, thereby enhancing ZEW's visibility. It is welcomed that the institute monitors the use of the Mannheim Innovation Panel for research publications. This system should be extended to other datasets.

Currently, ZEW relies, among others, on the ethics committee of the University of Mannheim for clearance of its research projects. Since the university's **ethics committee** is part of the medical faculty, the plans to establish an ethics committee at ZEW are appreciated, particularly in light of the institute's plans to establish a hub for field experiments. As part of its compliance rules for assessing potential conflicts of interest in third-party funded projects, e.g. when commissioning companies are directly affected by the recommendations, the institute applies the Code of Ethics of the *Verein für Socialpolitik*.

Quality management by advisory boards and supervisory board

The Scientific Advisory Council (SAC) meets bi-annually. The support the SAC provided to ZEW during the difficult time when the institute leadership changed twice in a short period (i.e. in 2014 and 2016) is much appreciated. Given this experience, it is understandable, that the institute aimed to keep SAC-members familiar with ZEW's history involved. It is good to see, however, that as recommended by the Senate of the Leibniz Association, the institute has introduced a term limit for SAC-members since the last evaluation; new members now serve a maximum of two terms of four years each. These rules should now also be implemented for all SAC-members who have been rendering outstanding services to ZEW for a long time. To avoid potential conflicts of interest, researchers who cooperate closely with ZEW should not be members of the Scientific Advisory Council (SAC). Out of the 13 members of the SAC, only two come from institutions outside of Germany. ZEW should use the upcoming appointments to increase the number of members coming from abroad, as was already recommended at the last evaluation.

The SAC conducts an audit between evaluations, in which ZEW's overall structures and strategies are examined conscientiously and constructively. Until now, this audit has been conducted shortly before the evaluation by the Senate of the Leibniz-Association. Understandably, ZEW aims to use synergies between the audit and the evaluation. However, to fulfil the audit's objective, it should be conducted in the middle between two evaluations, as proposed by the Senate of the Leibniz-Association.

5. Human Resources

Leading scientific and administrative positions

ZEW is led very capably by the **president** and the **managing director**. The president took up office shortly after the last evaluation. He is jointly appointed to a W3-professorship at the University of Mannheim. The managing director has held his position since 2004 and has made a significant contribution to ZEW's success. He will retire next year. It is good to see that, in having started the process to find a successor, ZEW is observing the "Standards for the appointment of administrative management positions in the Leibniz Association".

Since the last evaluation, ZEW has seen high staff turnover at the second **leadership** level: Six of the nine current research unit and research group heads are newly appointed, with the former heads moving on to professorships or other leadership positions. In addition, the head of the Research Unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics", which comprises ZEW's Research Data Centre (see Chapter 7), will retire this year. The process to find a successor was managed excellently, ensuring an overlap between the new and the old head.

All newly appointed research unit heads are appointed to W3-**professorships** at partner universities. ZEW aims to fill deputy leadership positions as W2-professorships. This approach makes sense, but presupposes that W2-positions will continue to be sufficiently attractive for suitable candidates in the future. Therefore, the supervisory board of ZEW and the University of Mannheim should ensure that W2-professorships can be advertised, as has been possible in Baden-Württemberg in previous years.

The cooperation agreement with the University of Mannheim was signed in 1992. In the event of an update, it should specify the rules for joint appointments. Until now, joint appointments with the University of Mannheim have typically involved two separate appointment committees. It would be beneficial, if ZEW and the university formed a joint committee to reach an agreement on the candidates early on.

Staff with a doctoral degree

ZEW has defined guidelines for promoting researchers at different career stages, specifying the available training and support measures and the skills that researchers are expected to possess.

The institute has a structured **tenure process** that allows every postdoctoral researcher to initiate a tenure merit review. The process is transparently organised and takes external expert opinions into account. So far, six ZEW researchers have completed their tenure merit review processes, of which four were successful.

Since the last evaluation, the institute has established **junior research groups** to extend the institute's research portfolio and allow young researchers to take on leadership responsibilities. The junior research groups are a very good instrument. The institute's strategy to grow junior research groups from topics that are developed within existing research units and reviewed regarding the fit of the thematic proposal and the potential ZEW-group leader, should be further developed and made more transparent.

Many ZEW-alumni have moved to **professorships** in Germany and beyond and to **leader-ship positions** in governmental agencies since the last evaluation. They often stay in touch as Research Associates at the institute so that their specific expertise is retained (see Chapter 6).

Doctoral candidates

As of 31 December 2021, 66 doctoral candidates were employed at ZEW. The institute has further developed its **graduate education** for economics and business administration in collaboration with the University of Mannheim, which now offers a "ZEW track" at the Mannheim Graduate School of Economics and Social Sciences. The ZEW scholarship programme for doctoral students started in 2019 and is funded by the State of Baden-Württemberg. The programme allows ten doctoral students in their first year to focus on graduate courses at the University of Mannheim without other commitments at ZEW. After the first year of high-quality theoretical and methodological training, the doctoral students decide whether they want to start their project work at ZEW. The programme has further increased the quality of training ZEW can offer its doctoral students and a decision by the State of Baden-Württemberg to extend the scholarship programme's funding would be highly appreciated.

The average duration to complete a doctoral degree at ZEW was 4.5 years. ZEW should ensure, that the average duration (including the time on a scholarship) is not prolonged.

Science supporting staff

ZEW provides appropriate training measures for its science-supporting staff. The institute's provision of vocational training opportunities and traineeships is appreciated. It is good to see that various training opportunities are offered for individuals interested in a career as IT specialists. As of 31 December 2021, the institute employed four apprentices and trainees.

Equal opportunities and work-life balance

Of the 131 people employed in research and scientific services on 31 December 2021, 36 % (47 researchers) were women, an increase compared to the last evaluation (37 out of 121). At the academic leadership level (president and heads of research units and research group), the proportion of women has increased from one out of eight in 2014 (13 %) to two out of ten in 2021 (20 %). With the appointment of a new female head of the Research Unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics" in 2023, the proportion has improved further. The equal share of men and women at the third leadership level is appreciated. In contrast, more women should be employed among junior research group heads and scientists in non-executive positions. ZEW should continue on its path and aim for having more female researchers and women in leadership positions than is otherwise the case in the discipline. It is welcomed that the institute is successful in the Leibniz Programme for Women Professors.

Since the last evaluation, ZEW has undertaken good measures to improve **family**-friendly working conditions. The institute should further clarify its strategy to improve working

conditions and continue striving to improve the support measures for researchers with care commitments.

6. Cooperation and environment

ZEW cooperates closely with **local universities**. Six ZEW researchers are jointly appointed with the <u>University of Mannheim</u>. The partnership also entails close cooperation with the Mannheim Graduate School of Economics and Social Sciences, the Mannheim Centre for Competition and Innovation (MaCCI), and the Leibniz ScienceCampus Mannheim Taxation. Three researchers hold professorships at the Faculty of Economics and Social Sciences of <u>Heidelberg University</u>. ZEW has presented promising plans to extend the collaboration with the Medical Faculty of Heidelberg University to strengthen the expertise related to health economics.

In addition to its local collaborative activities, the institute cooperates closely with several **other universities**. Within Germany, these include appointments of ZEW researchers at Giessen University, the University of Kassel, and a joint professorship for "experimental economics in market design" at Karlsruhe Institute of Technology (KIT). The institute has established an annual workshop within the field market design with KIT, ENS Paris-Saclay, and the Panthéon-Assas University Paris.

ZEW cooperates with other **Leibniz institutes** in four Leibniz research networks and alliances "Educational Potentials" (LERN), "Environmental Crisis – Crisis Environments", and "Health Technologies", as well as the "Leibniz Strategy Forum on Open Science".

The institute has an excellent programme to involve external and former researchers in its activities as ZEW **Research Associates**. These research associates play an important role in ZEW's national and international network and provide new sources of impetus for the institute's research work. As of 31 December 2021, 113 Research Associates contribute to ZEW's activities, of whom 38 are from institutions in other European countries and 14 from outside Europe.

Through various research projects, ZEW's research units maintain close relationships with many international partners, including the participation in Horizon 2020 and Horizon Europe projects. In 2016 and 2021, ZEW researchers were appointed to honorary professorships at the University of Luxembourg and the University of Strasbourg, respectively. As was already recommended in the previous evaluation, the institute should expand its institutional network at the European and international levels from a strategic point of view and build formal partnerships independent of researchers' or research units' personal ties in order to increase its institutional visibility.

7. Subdivisions of ZEW

Research Unit "Pensions and Sustainable Financial Markets"

(as of 31 December 2021: 8.6 FTE, of whom 2.4 FTE research and scientific services staff, 5.2 FTE doctoral candidates, and 1 FTE service staff)

The research unit investigates the behaviour of actors in financial markets. One research field focusses on the financial behaviour of private households, an area in which the unit has particularly strong expertise relating to the impact of financial literacy on household decision-making. With the "Pension Dashboard", which helps individuals find out their pension entitlements, the unit has developed an important tool, which is also used to conduct field experiments on the impact of information provision on individual saving decisions. The unit's second research field investigates the behaviour of institutional players such as banks and financial advisors. The recent projects on investor preferences for green finance and on linkages between the supply and demand side in financial markets provide a promising research direction and tie in well with other ZEW units. Extending these collaborations would benefit the unit in implementing its promising research agenda.

The unit has been rebuilding since a change in leadership in 2019 and is expected to grow, partly thanks to recent successes in obtaining third-party funding. Its research results are highly visible and published mostly in field journals. The work on financial literacy and gender can potentially lead to publications in general-interest economics journals. The unit cooperates closely with the University of Mannheim in the joint initiative Mannheim Institute for Financial Education (MIFE), which was established in 2020 and focusses on basic research on financial literacy and on the conditions for financial education interventions. The Financial Markets Survey conducted by the unit has a long-standing tradition as an important dataset in this field. Continuous testing of the indicators derived from this data and comparisons with other indicators of expectations for economic performance will be important in the future and it is good to see, that the unit plans to conduct further projects to validate the survey. In the last years, it has authored many policy briefs, including the monthly *ZEW-Finanzmarktreport*. Overall, the unit is rated as "very good to excellent".

Research Unit "Labour Markets and Social Insurance"

(as of 31 December 2021: 14.1 FTE, of whom 5.5 FTE research and scientific services staff, 7.9 FTE doctoral candidates, and 0.7 FTE service staff)

The research unit examines institutions and structural changes of labour markets. Its research is organised into the areas digitalisation, structural change, education, and health as well as the junior research group on migration (funded by the Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs). The unit has achieved high visibility with a widely-noted OECDreport and follow-up paper on automation. Innovative work is also conducted on the effects of immigration on demand for local labour. Since the last evaluation, the methodological portfolio has been extended and the unit has started conducting field experiments on the implementation of market design approaches in labour markets and for school admissions. The plans to further extend the use of field experiments, for example in relation to structural factors for working from home following the COVID-pandemic, are highly promising.

After the head of the unit left in 2016, the unit was under interim leadership until July 2022. Despite shrinking in terms of staff, the unit managed its research portfolio very well over the interim period. It publishes highly visible research results, e.g. on the economics of education. It provides important and unique datasets, such as the IAB-ZEW linked employer-employee panel. By participating in advisory committees, such as advisory boards appointed by the Federal Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs, the unit's members pursue important ways to transfer its research results to policymakers. Third-party funding is at an appropriate level, with the majority of funding obtained from the federal and *Länder* governments as well as a reasonable level of DFG-funding. The new head further expands the research agenda on health-related labour market outcomes. He brings a diverse international network to a unit that is already well-connected within Germany and Europe. Overall, the unit is rated as "excellent".

Research Unit "Digital Economy"

(as of 31 December 2021: 16.5 FTE, of whom 6 FTE research and scientific services staff, 9 FTE doctoral candidates, and 1.5 FTE service staff)

The research unit focusses on measurements of digitalisation and analyses of its economic impact. Its research areas investigate the diffusion of digital technologies, corporate strategies, and digital platforms. A junior research group examines digital market design. The unit has established a strong reputation within Germany and beyond for its expertise in the digital economy. Within its research projects, it collects important datasets on the digitalisation of the German economy. The research addresses timely topics, such as the economic effects of the increasing availability of artificial intelligence. A particular strength lies in policy advice, among others through the unit head's participation in the Commission of Experts for Research and Innovation (EFI-Kommission).

The well-established unit's research results are highly visible in the management and marketing sciences through leading international publications. Some of the topics have the potential to increase the unit's visibility beyond business science and the unit is encouraged to broaden its publication outlets to include economics journals. The unit obtained an impressive level of third-party funding, including high levels of funding from contract research. Since the last evaluation, the unit has continuously developed its research agenda and extended its methodological portfolio for data collection using algorithmic predictive models, web-scraping, and natural language processing algorithms. The plans to compare data collected with these methods to other measures for innovation are welcomed. Overall, the unit is rated as "excellent".

Research Unit "Economics of Innovation and Industrial Dynamics"

(as of 31 December 2021: 24.4 FTE, of whom 10.1 FTE research and scientific services staff, 11.3 FTE doctoral candidates, and 3.1 FTE service staff)

The research unit is organised into five research areas and the junior research group on "Competition and Innovation". It covers a wide range of topics, from the determinants of innovation to high-tech start-ups and the junior group looking at competition rules and the functioning of markets. The unit cooperates closely with the University of Mannheim in the Mannheim Centre for Competition and Innovation (MaCCI), which aims to foster interdisciplinary research, involving legal and economic perspectives of competition, regulation, and innovation policy. With several extensive and unique datasets available for external use through the ZEW Research Data Centre (FDZ, see Chapter 2), such as the Mannheim Enterprise Panel and the Mannheim Innovation Panel, it provides a great service for the research community. For its junior researchers, the unit should ensure an adequate balance between data collection/maintenance tasks and research projects.

Many of the unit's research projects explore the existing datasets for new insights. The projects frequently lead to important results published in international management and economics outlets. It has an excellent record in securing funding, mostly from contract research and the government. It should aim to obtain more funding from the EU. The unit's international network offers high potential for promising applications to Horizon Europe funding lines.

The plans to further develop the data infrastructure are promising, for example using artificial intelligence to establish innovation indicators or linking existing datasets to administrative data. In June 2023, the unit head retired. He had overseen the very successful development of the unit since 1994. It is good to see that the succession had been settled early and that there was an overlap between the outgoing and incoming leadership. The new unit head brings promising new angles on entrepreneurship and economics of science to the unit. Overall, the unit is rated as "very good to excellent".

Research Unit "Market Design"

(as of 31 December 2021: 11.2 FTE, of whom 6 FTE research and scientific services staff, 4.8 FTE doctoral candidates, and 0.5 FTE service staff)

The research unit is organised into two areas: Auction markets and Design of Matching markets. Since its establishment at ZEW in 2016, it has developed strong expertise in auction theory and in applying market design approaches to different contexts such as energy markets, food donations, and spectrum auctions by public authorities. The unit has an outstanding publication record, with some research results achieving high visibility in internationally leading general economics journals. Particularly noteworthy are policy-oriented projects, such as KitaMatch, where the unit applied market design to improve allocation mechanisms for child care places by simplifying the allocation mechanism and increasing its acceptance.

The unit should build on recent successes in securing funding for policy-oriented research projects thereby increasing third-party funding. It cooperates closely with other ZEW

units to apply market design approaches to various fields and to supervise PhD-students. The plans to increasingly incorporate field experiments and develop research on health markets are very promising. Overall, the unit is rated as "excellent".

Research Unit "Environmental and Climate Economics"

(as of 31 December 2021: 14.3 FTE, of whom 9.3 FTE research and scientific services staff, 3 FTE doctoral candidates, and 2 FTE service staff)

This research unit covers a wide range of topics across its three research areas decarbonisation policies, cooperative behaviour for sustainability, and the impact of environmental policy on individuals. It has produced notable research results, including on the effects of pro-environmental certification on manufacturing emissions. The expert briefs on the EU emissions trading system are examples of close linkages between its research projects and policy transfer activities. Another excellent transfer result is the contribution to the UN Climate Change Conferences through side events organised by the unit, which were held alongside the official negotiations at COP 23 (in 2017) and COP 24 (2018).

The unit's researchers are highly visible through their publications in relevant field journals. The publication of research results in high impact general interest journals (e.g. in *Nature Climate Change*) is appreciated. The unit has the potential to publish more in the top economics journals. It successfully obtains third-party funding through competitive procedures, particularly from the EU. Since 2020 the unit has been under new leadership. It is encouraged to pursue its plans to extend its research portfolio toward behavioural theory. Overall, the unit is rated as "excellent".

Research Unit "Corporate Taxation and Public Finance"

(as of 31 December 2021: 15.2 FTE, of whom 7.1 FTE research and scientific services staff, 6.8 FTE doctoral candidates, and 1.4 FTE service staff)

The unit's research agenda is centred on corporate taxation and empirical public economics in the context of European integration. With its combination of public economics and business expertise, it occupies a unique position within Germany. The junior research group "public procurement" adds an important and timely research angle. For example, the unit conducts important research on digital taxes. It also widely contributes to European fiscal policy debates.

The publication strategy targeting highly visible international journals, on the one hand, and practitioner journals, on the other, is implemented well and has led to a first-class publication record. The data collected, for example, on tax parameters, is widely used in public finance. The unit collaborates with the University of Mannheim in the Leibniz-ScienceCampus MannheimTaxation and the European Commission's Directorate General for Taxation and Customs Union. Third-party funding is at a high level and includes funding by the DFG for a Collaborative Research Centre project. The plans to further extend the methodological toolbox by adding simulation tools and field experiments are welcomed, as are the plans to further develop the research agenda on the political economy of fiscal rules. Overall, the unit is rated as "excellent".

Research group "Inequality and Public Policy"

(as of 31 December 2021: 12.1 FTE, of whom 4.4 FTE research and scientific services staff, 6.8 FTE doctoral candidates, and 0.9 FTE service staff)

This research group analyses the design and distributional effects of public policies in Europe using simulation methods, microeconometric research designs, surveys, and field experiments. In 2017 and 2022, when its leaders left ZEW for professorships at the universities in Munich (and ifo) and Cologne, the research group underwent substantial structural changes. The group leader who left in 2022 naturally took with him the ERC Starting Grant that he had won in 2020 for a project on housing policy and regional inequality to his new institution. As a result, the group is in a process of re-establishment as a smaller research group under new leadership. Currently, it covers three topics: measurement of inequality, distributional effects of taxes and transfer, and inequality and demography. It is now facing the challenge of further sharpening its research portfolio. Therefore, it is reasonable that it does not plan to continue the research field on "regional policy and spatial inequality" covered by the previous unit head. It has presented promising research projects, on the long-term consequences of the reduced labour supply of mothers, among others.

Despite the structural changes the group has experienced in recent years, it has achieved an impressive publication record. It has conducted projects with high transfer impacts, such as expert analysis provided for the federal government's Report on Poverty and Wealth and a distributional analysis of the German party programmes for the 2021 election. The plans to further develop the unit's microsimulation models and investigate climate policy's impact on inequality offer high potential for important research results. Overall, the unit is rated as "very good to excellent".

Research group "Health Care Markets and Health Policy"

(as of 31 December 2021: 2.3 FTE, of whom 1 FTE research and scientific services staff and 1.3 FTE doctoral candidates)

This research group was established in 2021 and is funded by the State of Baden-Württemberg. It pursues very promising projects on healthcare providers, hospital's capacity planning, and field experiments on digital health. The activities are not advanced enough yet to be provided with an overall rating, but have the potential to lead to important research results with high societal impact. They fit very well into ZEW's research profile, for example by looking at health care provision from an industrial organisation perspective and by innovatively using existing ZEW datasets to address shortages in the data availability on health care providers.

ZEW plans to permanently establish the topic of health economics as a Research Unit. For this purpose, the institute aims to apply for an extraordinary item of expenditure (see Chapter 3).

ZEW successfully addressed the recommendations of the German Science and Humanities Council (*Wissenschaftsrat*) concerning the establishment of the research field on "design of markets and institutions" in 2018. With regard to the evaluation by the Leibniz Association Senate in 2016 (see status report, p. A-20ff), the recommendations to establish strategic partnerships at the European level (recommendation 4), to involve more female researchers in its activities (recommendation 5) and to observe the guidelines regarding the "Organisation and Tasks of the Leibniz Institutes' Scientific Advisory Boards" (recommendation 7) still apply.

Appendix

1. Review Board	
Chair (Member of the Leibniz Senate Evaluation Committee)	
Alexandra Spitz-Oener	Department of Economics, Humboldt-Uni- versität zu Berlin
Deputy Chair (Member of the Leibniz Senate Evaluation Committee)	
Konrad Fiedler	Department of Botany and Biodiversity Re- search, Division of Tropical Ecology and Animal Biodiversity, University of Vienna, Austria
Reviewers	
Jeannette Brosig-Koch	Professor of Behavioral Social Policy, Uni- versity of Magdeburg
Michał Grajek	Professor of Economics, European School of Management and Technology (ESMT) Berlin
Frank Krysiak	Professor of Environmental Economics, University of Basel, Switzerland
Marek Pycia	Professor of Organizational Economics, University of Zurich, Switzerland
Farid Toubal	Professor of Economics, University of Paris-Dauphine – PSL, France
Silke Übelmesser	Professor of Economics / Public Finance, University of Jena
Guglielmo Weber	Professor of Econometrics, University of Padua, Italy
Friederike Welter	President of the Institut für Mittelstands- forschung, Bonn
Representative of the Federal Government	
Ruben Reike	Federal Ministry of Education and Re- search, Bonn
Representative of the Länder Governments (Member of the Leibniz Senate Evaluation Com- mittee)	

Jutta Koch-Unterseher Senate Department for Higher Education and Research, Health and Long-Term Care, Berlin Annex C: Statement of the Institution on the Evaluation Report

ZEW - Leibniz Centre for European Economic Research, Mannheim

The employees and board of directors of ZEW would like to express their sincere gratitude to everyone involved, especially the evaluators, for their exceptional efforts. We are delighted by the excellent evaluation of the institute. We consider the results as a mandate to continue on the path we have embarked upon. The recommendations of the review board are highly valuable for this purpose and will be implemented promptly.